WESTERN SYDNEY
UNIVERSITY

eSMART LIBRARIES EVALUATION REPORT: WAVE TWO FINDINGS

PREPARED FOR
THE ALANNAH & MADELINE FOUNDATION

Rebecca Morecroft
Associate Professor Amanda Third
Dr Michelle Blanchard
Gina Tracas
Harriette Richards
Dr Emma Kearney

eSMART LIBRARIES EVALUATION REPORT: WAVE TWO FINDINGS

Prepared for the Alannah & Madeline Foundation

Rebecca Morecroft
Project Manager
Institute for Culture and Society
Western Sydney University

Gina Tracas
Data Analyst
Social Policy Consultant

Associate Professor Amanda Third
Principal Research Fellow
Western Sydney University

Harriette Richardson
PhD Candidate
Western Sydney University

Dr Michelle Blanchard
Head of Projects and Partnerships
Young and Well CRC*
* to 30 June 2016

Dr Emma Kearney
Senior Research Officer
Institute for Culture and Society
Western Sydney University

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Western Sydney University
Institute for Culture and Society

Western Sydney University is a modern, research-led metropolitan university established in the late 1980s. Western Sydney University nurtures a distinctive, high-impact research culture, committed to enhancing our region's cultural, economic, environmental and educational development, and is responsive to contemporary challenges in Greater Western Sydney and beyond.

westernsydney.edu.au/ics

The Alannah & Madeline Foundation

The Alannah & Madeline Foundation is a national charity that aims to keep children safe from violence. The Foundation was established in memory of Alannah and Madeline Mikac, aged 6 and 3, who, with their mother and 32 others were killed at Port Arthur, Tasmania, on 28 April 1996. The Foundation cares for children who experience or witness serious violence and develops programs designed to help prevent violence in the lives of children. The Foundation's National Centre Against Bullying (NCAB) is a peak body comprised of experts in the areas of bullying and cyberbullying.

amf.org.au

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

eSmart Libraries is a behaviour-change initiative developed by the Alannah & Madeline Foundation in partnership with the Telstra Foundation; collaborating with Australia's library network to connect libraries and their users with tools and resources to improve cybersafety and wellbeing online, and facilitate digital inclusion in the community. The initiative was developed in response to a concern that an increasing digital divide was leaving some of Australian society's most vulnerable members lacking in the skills and knowledge to be smart, safe and responsible users of technology (AMF, 2012).

This report is the second in a series of three reports that looks at the success factors and barriers to implementation of the eSmart Libraries framework for library services. In this second wave of data collection there were over 500 participants across 12 library service sites nationally. The research team conducted focus groups, interviews and surveys with seven library services, including three that had participated in the first wave of data collection. In addition, the research team undertook interviews only with five further library services, five library industry representatives and three members of the eSmart Libraries Team at the AMF.

The report is structured according to the four key evaluation topics:
- Area 1: Impact;
- Area 2: Implementation;
- Area 3: Partner and Industry Objectives;
- Area 4: Perceptions.

The implementation of the eSmart Libraries initiative comes at a time when the role of library services in their communities is significantly transforming. The traditional, transactional relationship between library staff and users is changing as technology provides new ways of delivering services. More and more public libraries are playing a key role as digital hubs for local communities. By providing access and education programs, they actively contribute to improving digital participation within those communities. The combination of locality and free access to devices, connectivity and education uniquely positions public libraries as places and spaces where digital participation can be promoted and supported (Jaeger, Bertot, Thompson, Katz, & DeCoster, 2012).

The eSmart Libraries initiative offers library services a holistic framework, grounded in social and behavioural change communication theory (SBCC), which targets library leadership; policy, procedures and strategy; staff knowledge and capability; guidance and learning for library users; and community engagement.

AREA 1: IMPACT

According to participating library management, the eSmart Libraries framework reinforced, supported and enhanced their library services' activities in the digital literacy and cybersafety space, across all the framework domains. Libraries reported that the initiative was providing them with the knowledge and tools to ensure they were able to deliver digital services to library users in a safe and supportive environment.

All surveyed library managers (100%) and 87% of library staff reported feeling competent and confident online to support library users to use technology in their library.

A key domain for influencing behaviour change for library services was staff training, which was seen as essential in enabling the eSmart Libraries framework to positively influence library users. Findings highlighted that library users were often aware of training opportunities within their library; yet, in focus group discussions, they reported seeking out one-on-one support from staff for technology-related issues. Interviews with local government representatives, library management and library staff highlighted that libraries were spending more and more time supporting library users in building their digital literacy and undertaking community engagement activities. This demand on library staff for support with technology use has required libraries to rethink how they deliver education and training to support library users' needs. A focus on staff digital literacy, coupled with the other core components of the eSmart strategy, will more successfully impact library users' experience of technology in the long term.

There is clear opportunity to better support libraries to develop stronger community connections. For example, mentoring between library services may help library services struggling in this domain to develop creative approaches and actions to foster their engagement with the community.

AREA 2: IMPLEMENTATION

eSmart Coordinators reported effective or very effective communication with the AMF. This included receiving timely and encouraging feedback that helped them progress through the implementation. Implementation of the framework was successful when the eSmart Coordinator was a staff member who had interest, expertise and passion for technology, as well as experience or understanding of how to work with the library service's management team. **The majority of surveyed library managers (80%) were very confident in their eSmart Coordinator.**

Some library managers and staff reported that the complexity of the framework appeared initially to be an obstacle to effective implementation; as it meant staff were overwhelmed at first or implementation took a significant amount of time. Ensuring that a staff member had the right skillset to take up the eSmart Coordinator role helped the working group to navigate the authorising environment within local government and to advocate for the necessary time allocation to support effective implementation.

AREA 3: PARTNER AND INDUSTRY OBJECTIVES

Facilitating digital inclusion
Libraries were utilising the eSmart Libraries framework to ensure that both the physical and the digital library spaces were seen as safe places for library users. Library services reported a variety of approaches to support their communities to access technology in a safe, smart and responsible manner. In particular, libraries' investment in the eSmart Libraries framework has supported the implementation of strategies to create public library environments that are supportive of library users in increasing their cybersafety knowledge and digital literacy skills. This is an essential component of any behaviour-change program directed at enhancing users' safe, smart and responsible engagement online.

Opportunities exist to continue to build on this work to enhance the brand and the key messages of eSmart Libraries, to increase impact on library users.

Working with industry partners
eSmart Libraries has demonstrated that it can provide a foundation for the library industry to navigate the impact of the digital transformation agenda and technology more broadly. Through its eSmart Libraries reference groups and participation in sector activities, the AMF has developed strong strategic relationships across national and state library-industry peak bodies. The AMF is well positioned to draw on these strong relationships to support libraries seeking leadership and guidance in navigating the impact of technology on their industry; as they face the challenge of defining their role and offerings in relation to the digital transformation agenda, often with limited additional resourcing or support. Findings of this evaluation highlighted that the eSmart Libraries framework was enhancing library services' work by guiding them via a systematic approach to online user access policies and procedures, staff and library user training, and outreach in the community.

Cyberbullying

All surveyed library managers (100%) and 59% of staff reported that eSmart Libraries had made a difference to cybersafety and the management of cyberbullying.

While young people reported that they learn about cybersafety primarily through their schools, they also reported that public libraries are offering consistent messaging about online safety; embedding appropriate policy and procedures to ensure safety, and helping to build a community of understanding and good practice around online safety. In this way, public libraries are supporting the work undertaken by Australian schools to build young people's awareness of online safety.

AREA 4: PERCEPTIONS

Library management highlighted that implementing the framework gave the library an opportunity to demonstrate its skills and expertise in the cybersafety and digital literacy space to elected representatives. Significantly, **100% of surveyed library managers and 80% of surveyed staff said they would recommend the eSmart Libraries initiative to another library service.**

Local government representatives and library managers both discussed the need to ensure that, once libraries reached the sustaining phase, the momentum around eSmart did not dissipate. They reflected that library services need to continue to be proactive regarding updating resources as well as staff and user training in cybersafety and digital literacy, and that they benefited from support and prompts from the AMF.

INTRODUCTION

BACKGROUND

eSmart Libraries is a behaviour-change initiative developed by the Alannah & Madeline Foundation (AMF) in partnership with Telstra Foundation; collaborating with Australia's library network to connect libraries and their users with tools and resources to improve cybersafety and wellbeing and facilitate digital inclusion in the community.

Behaviour change is a research- based approach employed to address knowledge, attitudes and behaviours or practices. It is informed by a combination of theories including social cognitive theory, theory of planned behaviour and – best known – the transtheoretical or stages of change model. As an approach it has long been used in combination with broader social change strategies to underpin significant health initiatives, such as Quit, SunSmart, and those of the Transport Accident Commission and WorkSafe Victoria.

Behaviour change strategies focus on the individual as the locus for change. Social change, on the other hand, focuses on the community as the unit for change. The complementarity of these two approaches can be seen in social and behaviour change communications (SBCC). SBCC uses science and data, as well as creative ideas, in order to influence social norms in support of long-term, sustainable behaviour change at a population level; motivate shifts in behaviour and practice at the individual, organisation and community level; encourage community action; and influence decision-makers regarding provision of services, policy and regulation or legislative change.

In its design, development and implementation, the eSmart Libraries initiative has drawn on the learnings from these comprehensive change campaigns, as well as from the relevant theoretical frameworks. It was developed in response to concerns that an increasing digital divide is leaving some of our society's most vulnerable members lacking in the skills and knowledge to be smart, safe and responsible users of technology (AMF, 2012).

eSmart helps to embed a culture of positive technology use, create policies and procedures, provide access to evidence-informed resources and track progress in libraries becoming 'eSmart'.

Being an eSmart library means staff and users know how to guard against security and privacy risks online, download content in a legal and ethical way, research and reference information, and manage reputation and relationships in cyberspace.

The AMF engaged the Young and Well Cooperative Research Centre (Young and Well CRC) to undertake an evaluation of the eSmart Libraries initiative between August 2014 and May 2017. With the wind-up of the Young and Well CRC, the evaluation has been transferred to its partner organisation, Western Sydney University.

The evaluation has included two waves of data collection:
- Wave One (March–July 2015);
- Wave Two (March–July 2016).

Wave Two data collection aimed to gather evidence in four key areas as defined by the AMF:

- Area 1: Impact;
- Area 2: Implementation;
- Area 3: Partner and Industry Objectives;
- Area 4: Perceptions.

This Wave Two report provides useful and timely insights into both the success factors and barriers to implementation of the eSmart Libraries framework for library services. It sits alongside the Wave One preliminary findings report (2015), an independent evaluation of eSmart Schools (2015) and the AMF's own data monitoring through the online system tool and pre- and post- surveys.

A final report collating and comparing both waves of data will be delivered in mid 2017.

EVALUATION DESIGN

The methodology developed for the eSmart Libraries evaluation is grounded in a mixed-methods approach. It incorporates qualitative and quantitative methods of data collection to ensure an informative evaluation that provides timely and iterative feedback, to assist in the ongoing development of the eSmart Libraries framework.

Participating library services were based in the Australian Capital Territory, New South Wales, South Australia, Queensland, Victoria and Western Australia.

Library services were in one of three stages of implementation of the eSmart Libraries framework:

1. **Planning:** focuses on establishing mechanisms within the service to implement the eSmart Libraries framework; reviewing and identifying gaps in policies and procedures and assessing the knowledge and skills of staff and library users.

2. **Implementing:** focuses on renewing or creating all relevant policies and procedures; delivering training and developing opportunities for staff, library users and the broader community to learn and engage with cybersafety and digital literacy. At the end of this stage, a library is deemed to be 'eSmart'.

3. **Sustaining:** focuses on providing actions to retain eSmart status; evaluating impact, consistently reviewing library practices and sharing success.

In Wave Two the research team revisited three of the seven library services that had participated in Wave One of the evaluation and four new library services. Further to the seven participating library services, the research team undertook additional interviews only with five more library services bringing the total number of participating libraries up to twelve. The research team also undertook an intercept study in the main seven participating libraries, in which a research team member visited the library services and over a four-hour period, invited library users to complete an online survey. Research participants took part in one or more of three activities: an online survey, focus group or individual interview.
Research participants in the online survey were able to opt in to a lottery to receive one of ten $100 book vouchers and focus group and interview participants were given a $20 book voucher.

Importantly, in Wave Two, 11 of the 12 library services were in the sustaining phase. This is a significant difference from Wave One, in which only two of the seven participating libraries were in the sustaining phase. Findings should be interpreted in light of this distinction.

PARTICIPANTS

There were over 500 participants across the 12 library service sites in the Wave Two data collection phase.

215 library users participated in focus groups, interviews and/or the online survey:
- 18% were 25 years of age or under;
- 45% were aged 26–59 years;
- 37% were aged 60 years or over.

11 library managers and ten eSmart Coordinators were surveyed and/or interviewed.

257 library staff participated in surveys and/ or focus groups.

7 local government representatives participated in interviews.

4 library industry representatives participated in interviews, representing five peak bodies:
- Australian Library and Information Association (ALIA);
- Australian Public Library Alliance (APLA)
- National and State Libraries Australasia (NSLA)
- Public Libraries Australia (PLA);
- Public Libraries Victoria Network (PLVN).

3 Alannah & Madeline Foundation staff participated in interviews.

Survey participant statistics were as follows:
- 48% of library users had a degree or higher education;
- 19% of library users were retired;
- 16% of library users were students attending school or university;
- 49% of library users were undertaking full-time or part-time work;
- 71% of library users were female;
- 75% of library users spoke only English;
- 77% of library staff spoke only English.

Table: Wave Two data collection participant groups

Participant group	Survey	Focus group	Interview
Library managers	✔		✔
Library staff	✔	✔	
Library eSmart Coordinators	✔		✔
Library users: seniors aged 60+	✔	✔	✔
Library users: adults aged 26–59	✔	✔	✔
Library users: young people aged 10–25	✔		✔
Local government representatives			✔
Alannah & Madeline Foundation eSmart Libraries team			✔
Library industry representatives			✔

DATA ANALYSIS

Survey data was analysed using SPSS statistical analysis software.

Qualitative data was analysed via a thematic analysis of interview and focus group transcriptions.

The identities of all participating libraries and evaluation participants have been kept anonymous. Participants' real names have not been used in case studies.

LIMITATIONS

The eSmart Libraries evaluation methodology relied on voluntary uptake by library services. Invitations to participate in the evaluation were sent to library services that were registered with eSmart Libraries across Australia. Library services in the Australian Capital Territory, New South Wales, South Australia, Victoria and Western Australia expressed an interest. Further information was provided to library services in Queensland and Western Australia, inviting them to participate in the library manager and eSmart Coordinator interviews only; an additional five library services opted in.

The evaluation team worked with participating library services to promote the online survey. The survey was promoted and circulated through library services social media, websites, posters and flyers. Uptake was limited at some library services. Feedback from library services highlighted that the survey was long (up to 30 minutes to complete) and required proficiency in English.

In addition, library services assisted the research team to set up focus groups and interviews with library management, staff, and library users. In some instances the focus groups and interviews were well subscribed-to, and in some instances there was limited engagement, particularly by library users.

When viewing evaluation findings it is important to consider that there were limited participant numbers at some library services.

Not measured in this study was the work the AMF has been undertaking to improve the functionality of the system tool, visit the libraries more often, and offer individual support sessions; as these components of the eSmart Libraries initiative have only recently been introduced.

CONTEXT

The role of public libraries as collection hubs has changed dramatically in recent decades. More and more public libraries are playing a significant role as digital hubs for local communities, and actively contributing to improving digital participation within those communities by providing access and education programs. The combination of locality, free access to devices, connectivity and education uniquely positions public libraries as places and spaces where digital participation can be promoted and supported (Jaeger, Bertot, Thompson, Katz & DeCoster, 2012).

The importance of libraries as key brokers for community access and education amid a rapidly changing digital environment, and, in particular, digital government services, is increasingly being recognised (Bertot, Real & Jaeger, 2016). Libraries are recognised as uniquely located community spaces where a diverse range of users might seek assistance to access and learn more about digital resources. Libraries are uniquely positioned to work in partnership with other community organisations and government agencies to strengthen community outreach programs that support digital literacy and inclusion in hard-to-reach community groups (Bertot, 2016; Fitzgerald, Fletcher & Kop, 2016). At the same time, governments can benefit from the established relationships public libraries have with their communities, as these existing connections bolster opportunities for community consultation activities and user-centred feedback.

According to 'Measuring Australia's Digital Divide: The Australian Digital Inclusion Index 2016', the groups that remain the most digitally excluded are people aged 65 years and over, people with a disability, people with lower-than-secondary education, Indigenous Australians, and people on low incomes or not in paid employment (Thomas, Barraket, Ewing, MacDonald, Mundell & Tucker, 2016).

The Australian Government recognises that people over the age of 65 years may need targeted programs to improve their levels of digital participation (Australian Communications and Media Authority, 2016). As part of its 2016 Federal election platform the Liberal–National Party Coalition made a commitment to bridging the digital divide for older Australians. The government has promised to invest $50 million to ensure that senior Australians acquire the skills and knowledge necessary to participate in the digital economy and to do so safely (Liberal Party of Australia, 2016).

Additional programs address the digital needs of other marginalised groups, such as Indigenous Australians. For example, In September 2015, Telstra committed $30 million to a three-year infrastructure co-investment agreement with the Northern Territory government. This continues Telstra's work on the Reconciliation Action Plan and is aimed at improving access and digital participation for remote Northern Territory communities.

These programs are important, but they do not meet the needs of all user groups. The distribution of public libraries across Australian communities makes them ideal partners for the wide rollout of targeted programs for a range of user groups. Linking libraries into local, state and federal government digital transformation strategies as they go through the design and implementation phases is a strategic way to ensure digital disadvantage is addressed.

KEY FINDINGS

AREA 1: IMPACT

Library Management and Staff

> *"I thought it was important that we undertook something like [eSmart Libraries] that had a lot of rigour around it, was a solid process that we had confidence in; so that we could get together and go, OK, I think we're doing the best we can in this space…"*
> *(Library manager, regional Queensland)*

Library services are undertaking a significant transition in relation both to the impact of digital technology and to their roles in communities. The traditional, transactional relationship between library staff and users is changing, as technology provides new ways of delivering services. Ninety-four per cent of surveyed staff reported that they use technology daily in their library role; with 59% undertaking IT troubleshooting. Library staff reported that the key benefits of technology in the library for their patrons include access to online library resources 24/7; accessibility of online services/products; and access to computer software/hardware. Library managers also reported the benefits of access to business and employment opportunities and entertainment.

With these benefits come significant challenges. With federal government agencies shifting to online service delivery, libraries are faced with the challenge and opportunity to support library users in navigating online space. Libraries consistently reported that they were assisting library users to access online forms and set up email accounts for MyGov (including Medicare, MyTax, family payments and job seeking), passport applications, Working with Children Checks and police incident reports. As one library service framed it: "We are helping people to navigate through their daily lives." Library services are bridging the digital literacy gap in their communities, providing support for community members to access technology in a safe way. Rising need in this area has raised concerns for staff regarding the purpose of their work, their confidence and capacity to assist, and challenges regarding the confidentiality of library users.

According to participating library management, the eSmart Libraries framework reinforces, supports and enhances their library services' activities in the digital literacy and cybersafety space across all the framework domains, which are outlined below.

Domains 1 and 2: Library Vision, Values and Leadership; and Agreements and Procedures

> *"I think that the framework is a good prompt…because it's very comprehensive in terms of all the things it covers off."*
> *(eSmart Coordinator, regional library service)*

At the time of the Wave Two evaluation, the eSmart Libraries framework either had been or was in the process of being embedded into participating library services' policies and procedures. More than 80% of library managers (83%) and staff (81%) reported improved policies and procedures to manage internet use in the library. Improvements included changes to or development of library policies in areas including terms and conditions of internet use; online incident response and reporting; staff performance reviews; position descriptions; staff code of conduct; induction processes; and training. Implementing eSmart Libraries triggered the review of existing policies, assisting library staff to identify gaps in policy and procedures; and provided a useful checklist to revisit once libraries reached the sustaining phase of the implementation.

Ensuring that there is local government and library leadership support for eSmart Libraries has been essential in enabling libraries to enact changes to policies and procedures. Of our sample, 85.5% of staff reported that management supported the implementation of eSmart.

Library management and local government representatives reported that they had utilised the new or updated polices and procedures to demonstrate to government executive and elected representatives the type of work the library is undertaking to support safe digital spaces in the community. This was viewed as a positive outcome of eSmart Libraries, helping library services to demonstrate their skills in the digital space.

> *"I think it's really good for Council to know that our libraries are in [the digital safety] sphere, and minimising our own risk, and promoting health and wellbeing to the rest of the community."*
> *(Library manager, rural Victoria)*

CASE STUDY #1 – LEVERAGING ESMART LIBRARIES POLICIES

Library Service A is a large metropolitan service in a growth area of a major Australian city. The service reached eSmart status in 2016. Its municipality is implementing a Smart Cities program, which focuses on liveability, sustainability and economic prosperity, with a strong emphasis on technology. In a presentation to a Council meeting, the library demonstrated how the eSmart Libraries framework was supporting digital literacy and ensuring responsible, smart, safe access to technology. This was well received in the context of the Smart Cities program.

> *"[We talked to] the Councillors about eSmart and what eSmart means and what we have achieved. That was well received. So I have to say it was a very proud moment for us."*
> *(Library manager, metropolitan library service)*

The local government manager charged with oversight of the library service suggested that the eSmart library policies could be implemented in other Council services. The library service has met with staff at a Council youth service facility to discuss whether and how the service could apply the library's eSmart policies. Library service staff are looking to assist the youth service to implement some eSmart policies, as the service is engaging with young people but does not have in place the same level of cybersafety policy and procedures.

Domain 3: Effective Staff Knowledge And Capabilities

> *"The benefit for the staff that I have seen is that [eSmart Libraries] has given them a lot more confidence to be able to know what is right and wrong and know how to act on it. A strong voice when talking with schools. A strong voice when dealing with individual patrons who might be using the internet for the first time and [are] being taught how to do it. A strong confidence when dealing with patrons who are not doing the right thing. It's given them real confidence to be able to follow up on those sorts of things, and a lot of pride."*
> *(Local government representative, metropolitan Victoria)*

eSmart Coordinators and library managers reported that implementation of the eSmart Libraries framework had brought online safety to the forefront of the library services' priorities, helping them to understand its importance and its relevance to all ages. It had also influenced staff training and raised staff awareness of cybersafety principles, with 100% of library managers and the majority of staff (93%) reporting improved staff knowledge and confidence in how to be safe, smart and responsible online.

Overall, survey data showed that staff were confident in their ability to be safe, smart and responsible online.

- 100% of library managers and 83% of staff reported increased knowledge of how to uphold responsibilities online.
- 87% of library managers and 81% of staff reported increased knowledge of how to stay safe online, protect privacy and report/act when encountering something unsafe.
- 100% of library managers reported being confident/very confident to manage low-level cybersafety risks, and 86% felt confident/very confident to manage high-level cybersafety risks.
- Overall, 100% of library managers and 87% of staff reported feeling competent and confident online to support library users to use technology in their library.

Although library services are embracing the changing technology landscape, there were examples of staff or library services finding technology destabilising and challenging to their sense of identity and purpose. Library services, particularly larger ones, face challenges in upskilling library staff in technology, due to large staff groups and varying levels of experience and confidence with technology use. In addition, some services see digital literacy as a specialist skill that should be provided by dedicated staff members; as is the case with, for example, children's literature or genealogy. This can impact on library services' ability to holistically embrace and manage changes in technology and library user needs; and points to the need to promote to libraries the value of generalising digital skills across their staff base.

Interestingly, both staff and management identified 'Domain 3: Effective staff knowledge and capabilities' as the most important domain in influencing behaviour change. Although successful behaviour-change programs require a number of components to support success, staff knowledge and capability is a key focus of library services. Libraries self-reported that only through upskilling staff will they be able to face one of their key challenges: namely, that of increasing public awareness about being safe, smart and responsible online. This presents an opportunity for

eSmart Libraries to demonstrate to the library industry how the initiative can provide a framework to navigate the impact of the digital transformation agenda, and technology more broadly, in order to meet the public's increasing needs and expectations in the digital space.

The majority of surveyed staff self-reported good levels of confidence in managing cybersafety risks in the library.
- 69% of staff felt confident/very confident to manage low-level cybersafety risks, and 57% felt confident/very confident to manage high-level cybersafety risks.
- 68% of staff thought their library colleagues felt competent and confident online and able to offer library users technological support if required.

In some instances, there was some disconnect between library management's implementation of the framework and library staff's follow-through, particularly where all staff hadn't yet been trained in eSmart. This was highlighted in focus groups and interviews, where staff members who had not participated in any formal cybersafety or digital literacy training demonstrated varying levels of confidence in discussing how they would respond or had responded to cyber-incidents in the library.

The eSmart Libraries framework requires library services to undertake staff training. An ongoing challenge for libraries is to find appropriate training programs or to resource staff to undertake training. Just over half (51%) of surveyed staff reported participating in training. The percentage of trained staff increased, the smaller the library service, highlighting the complexities of training large staff groups in digital literacy and cybersafety. Libraries were upskilling staff in a number of ways, such as building digital literacy into staff performance plans; including digital literacy skills in new staff position descriptions; offering individual staff professional development; or offering comprehensive training to small staff groups.

Training was most commonly delivered by a library colleague, as opposed to an external agency or the AMF. Staff and management consistently reported the need for ongoing and refresher training in cybersafety and new technologies, due to the demand on the library service. However, they also indicated that they were inhibited regarding participating in implementation of eSmart due to limited knowledge, confidence, time or experience; highlighting the complexity of offering training to staff. Training topics flagged by staff as areas of interest included scenario-based problem solving of serious cyber incidents; and refresher training on new technologies to increase familiarity and competence.

These findings highlight an opportunity for the AMF to work in partnership with libraries, government and non-government agencies to offer appropriate training programs for library staff in digital literacy and cybersafety. Staff who had undertaken training in digital literacy and cybersafety reported feeling confident to support library users to do the same.

In conclusion, library staff training is essential to ensuring the eSmart Libraries framework has an impact on library users. A focus on staff digital literacy, coupled with the other core components of the eSmart strategy, will more strongly impact library users' experience of technology in the long term.

> *"If we can influence our staff and inform our staff they're informing the community. I think that probably, to me…is a key area of achievement."*
> *(Library manager, metropolitan Victoria)*

CASE STUDY #2 – UPSKILLING STAFF

Library Service B is a library service in a large, growing, northern suburb of a major Australian city. The service has a staff of 46 EFT, and almost twice as many actual personnel, as there are significant numbers of part-time staff. Training a large part-time staff whose time is limited is a challenge for the library service. It has taken a creative approach to upskilling staff across its four main library-service sites. The service has a training team comprising staff from across all service sites. The team's new model is to decide on training needs for the library staff and roll out training through a tiered system.

The tiered system includes:

Tier One: Train-the-trainer model. For any new system that is implemented in the library service, the training team is trained first.

Tier Two: Training team members then train their colleagues. The team develops a training schedule. This may include group and individual training sessions.

Tier Three: 'Happy-hour training'. All staff are allocated an hour every fortnight in which they can undertake self-directed education, guided by the training team's list of recommended resources.

The tiered model helps to mitigate the challenges of upskilling a large, part-time staff base, by ensuring that there is a regular variety of opportunities for staff to participate.

Domain 4: Guidance And Learning For Users

Library services reported a range of ways that they support library users to access technology, including providing:
- free access to computers;
- free wi-fi service;
- digital literacy and cybersafety training (group and one-on-one);
- technology advice sessions (group and one-on-one);
- fact sheets on how to use technology and cybersafety;
- opportunities via invitation through government agencies, to provide one-on-one support to community members..

In addition to the support provided to library users to access technology and build digital literacy, libraries also promote cybersafety education through a range of approaches, including:
- visual promotion – interactive boards, bookmarks, banners and posters (90% of staff and 100% of library managers reported having visible information in their library about being smart, safe and responsible online);
- resources – cybersafety fact sheets for young people and parents;
- library websites with e-resource links to cybersafety awareness (reported by 85% of managers and 82% of staff);
- promotion of internet terms and conditions of use (reported by 89% of staff and 100% of managers);
- staff training in cybersafety (reported by 100% of managers and 76% of staff);
- running specific cybersafety programs for the public or integrating cybersafety training into general library-user training.

Overall, libraries reported that the eSmart initiative was providing them with the knowledge and the tools to ensure they are able to deliver digital services to library users in a safe and supportive environment. Later in this report, we discuss the impact of these approaches on library users, and how the eSmart Libraries framework is supporting library services to consider all aspects of cybersafety and digital literacy for users.

"I think it's given us structure and form and it's given us a focus and it's given us confidence. I think that's probably the biggest one. It's given us the confidence to be able to say this is what we do and this is how we do it and this is why we do it and we're looking after this for the community."
(Library manager, metropolitan library service)

FURTHER EXAMPLES – SUPPORTING THE DIGITAL LITERACY OF LIBRARY USERS

Library services have implemented various other approaches to support library users to improve their digital literacy, and to support them to access the services they need online, including:
- inviting Centrelink staff into the library service to assist library users one-on-one with MyGov;
- inviting Australian Tax Office representatives into the library to assist library users with MyTax;
- employing in-house tech-support staff to assist with day-to-day support and training.
- upskilling small cohorts of staff to deliver one-on-one and group training sessions with library users, and with library staff members;
- hosting tech information sessions on a weekly or fortnightly basis, where library users can ask any technology-related questions;
- developing 'quick start guides' for library users – for example, on how to use library e-resources;
- working with university students to develop a digital literacy training program;
- delivering targeted training such as Telstra's Tech Savvy Seniors.

Domain 5: Community Connections

eSmart Coordinators and library management reported a variety of ways they had engaged with their community since implementing the eSmart Libraries framework, including:

- utilising eSmart staff working groups, established in each participating library, to explore collaborative community partnerships;
- attending community and school events to promote library digital services and online safety;
- engaging with local media to promote libraries' digital services and promote their work on eSmart.

For some participating library services, engaging with the broader community outside the library service has been challenging. They saw this domain as a work in progress that is highly dependent on resourcing and capacity.

There is clear opportunity to better support libraries to develop stronger community connections. Opportunities such as mentoring arrangements between library services may help those struggling in this domain to develop creative approaches and actions to foster their engagement with the community.

CASE STUDY #3: COMMUNITY CONNECTIONS

Library Service C is a regional library service that has partnered with the Local Learning and Employment Network (LLEN) to support information communications technology (ICT) career events at local secondary schools across the shire. In 2016 this library was planning to run workshops using robotics activities, demonstrating what the library is offering in the tech space. The library also provides resources on "staying safe online, anti-bullying, and information about online tutorials that are available for students".

> *"The LLEN and the library, we feel…have some great partnerships going on […] The library here is always very willing to assist us with anything that we've got going on in the schools…" (Adult library user, regional Victoria)*

Library users

"I would assume that there's good security set-up and that it's reviewed and updated regularly. I'm also assuming that the library service would take that very seriously, as a top priority, because of the number of users, including students and [older people] accessing the computers…"
(Adult library user, metropolitan Victoria)

ACCESS TO TECHNOLOGY

Evaluation data indicated that library users believe libraries to be safe and supportive environments. Libraries were seen as important for social interaction and for access to technology. Access to technology through the library service was valued for a variety of reasons, providing benefits such as offsite access to the collection; reserving and borrowing books; loan of e-books; printing; and free computer, internet and wi-fi access. Technology accessed in the library included:
- library catalogue (53%);
- free wi-fi (47%);
- internet search engines (34%);
- public-access computers (26%).

All library users surveyed used technology on a daily basis. Ninety per cent of surveyed library users used technology in the library. Just over half (55%) of library users visited the library on a weekly or daily basis, demonstrating that they regularly use technology in the library.

Reported internet use in the library was as follows:
- 16% of respondents used it daily;
- 22% of respondents used it weekly;
- 20% of respondents never used it.

The majority of respondents (86%) reported that it was easy/very easy to access the internet in the library. Only 4% of library users reported having technical or access issues when using the internet in the library.

Library services reported using the eSmart Libraries framework to review how they are providing online access within the library, or to help demonstrate to government executive or IT services how they are mitigating risky online behaviour within the library, through applying appropriate guidelines and anticipating expected behaviours informed by the framework.

CASE STUDY #4 – ACCESS TO TECHNOLOGY (1). ADULT LIBRARY USER, METROPOLITAN LIBRARY

John is a regular computer user at his local metropolitan library service. The library service has a large number of public PC terminals as well as free wi-fi access. The service promotes online safety and digital literacy training through its event program and website.

John is new to computers: he has been teaching himself to use them in the library over the past two years. He cannot afford to have a computer at home and has not been able to get his landlord to install a landline connection for the internet. Free access in the public library has allowed him to start to learn about the internet. He has recently purchased a wi-fi dongle and has a tablet, but he still regularly visits the library to access email.

John has not participated in any training programs. He is not aware of any for in his age group (26-59 years), although they do exist. When he needs support, which is often, he calls on the library staff, and, in particular, the IT staff. He writes down the instructions they give him in order to improve his knowledge and to help minimise the number of times he has to ask for assistance. "The staff are really great here...they have helped me out a lot…"

John tries to be safety-conscious online. He's conscious of having a strong password; he thinks a lot about whether emails may be spam, and asks staff if he is unsure. John will continue to use the internet in his public library for the foreseeable future. The library service offers him not only free access, but also staff to ask advice of, as he navigates the online space.

KNOWLEDGE

> *"I feel safer online just because of the course I've done through [the library]."*
> *(Adult library user, regional South Australia)*

> *"U3A recommend that people come down [to the library]... I'm involved with U3A here…and so, when people are sort of struggling with computer skills, we suggest they come and practise in the library."*
> *(Senior adult library user, metropolitan Victoria)*

The majority of library users participating in the research (84%) were confident that their local library staff would be able to assist them if they came across something unsafe online. This demonstrates the trusted and supportive environment libraries offer their users for connecting safely online.

> *"I think people see the library as a trusted place to get that type of information or receive that kind of service and advice; and the other thing, too…I think libraries are well placed to have that space in the community, and it's not replicated by another service provider..."*
> *(Library manager, metropolitan Victoria)*

Surveyed library users reported gaining their cybersafety information from a wide variety of sources but did not indicate a preference for receiving this information from any particular source. Twelve per cent of library users reported learning about cybersafety from their library. Other information sources included:
• school (19%);
• work/colleagues (17%);
• media (16%);
• friends (16%).

Parents reported that their children learnt about cybersafety from:
• parents (56%);
• school (44%);
• friends (5%);
• library (5%).

Forty-three per cent (43%) of surveyed respondents reported seeing advertising for cybersafety training in their library. Library users who had participated in training in their library (8%) had learnt primarily about:
• image reputation protection;
• identity protection;
• privacy and social media.

Findings highlighted that library users were often aware of training opportunities within their library; but in focus group discussions, they reported seeking out one-on-one support from staff for technology-related issues. Interviews with local government representatives, library management and library staff highlighted that libraries are spending increasing amounts of time supporting library users to build their digital literacy and undertaking community engagement activities. This demand on library staff for assistance with using technology had required libraries to rethink how they delivered education and training to support library user needs.

Examples of initiatives that had been implemented by participating libraries in response to this issue included:
- 'tech-time' sessions – where library users can turn up and ask any tech-related question;
- one-on-one, half-hour training sessions with a staff member;
- development of 'quick use' guides to step a library user through how to use a library resource.

The fact that library users seek out one-on-one and personalised support from staff reinforces the importance of staff education and training, in order for the eSmart message to reach library users. Library users reported that they had been exposed to and/or were aware of a range of risky cyber-incidents, including credit-card or email scams, identity theft, cyberbullying and exposure to pornography.

Overall, library users reported being confident in their use of technology. Survey findings indicated that:
- 91% of surveyed library users were confident of their ability to stay safe online;
- 86% knew how to protect their online privacy;
- 71% knew how to report/act when they encountered something unsafe online.

Over half (55%) of surveyed parents with children under the age of 18 believed their children were confident of their ability to stay safe online.

These findings reflect a cohort of library users that uses technology regularly and self-report a high level of confidence. The findings do not provide data on the number of library users who have limited digital skills and seek support from library staff. This latter cohort requires significant support to keep up with changes in technology and government services being delivered online. Libraries are seeking creative and effective ways to continue to educate library users in cybersafety and digital literacy, particularly those who are seen as digitally excluded: for example, people aged 65 and over; people with disabilities; people who have not completed secondary education; Indigenous Australians; and people on low incomes or not in paid employment (Thomas et al., 2016). Opportunities exist for the AMF to work with the library industry to develop targeted resources and training for digitally excluded groups accessing public libraries (see Key Findings, Area 4).

Although library management and staff were able to articulate how the eSmart Libraries framework had impacted on their own digital literacy and cybersafety in the library, the same was not true of library users. Library cybersafety and digital literacy training was not commonly branded 'eSmart', making it difficult for library users to make a direct correlation with the eSmart brand. They identified a variety of complementary initiatives – from school-based education activities, or programs such as Tech Savvy Seniors, through to the support of individual library staff – as having contributed positively to their learning about online safety and digital literacy. Our findings show that eSmart impacted library users indirectly,

An immediate opportunity exists to improve collaboration across eSmart Schools and eSmart Libraries: few examples were found of such engagement, and library services reported that they did not know or were unsure of which local schools were implementing eSmart. Taking up this opportunity could serve to build partnerships and strengthen the eSmart message across different settings (work, school, library and home); further developing the eSmart community of practice and by sharing, within the eSmart community, examples of schools and libraries successfully working together.

CASE STUDY #5 – THE 'SOCIAL STORY' OF A LIBRARY AS A SAFE PLACE

"There's a social story to how you're going to act and how you're going to present when you're at the library."
(Adult library user, regional library service).

Library Service C is a regional library, servicing a population of over 36,000. The library service reached eSmart status in December 2014. The library manager supported all staff to undertake a digital literacy and cybersafety training program that was developed in-house. Staff deliver tech-advice sessions with library users, are rolling out their second year of Telstra's Tech Savvy Seniors training, and have a proactive outreach program.

During the data collection phase the research team spoke with local support workers/ library users who work with people with intellectual and physical disabilities. The workers promote the library as a safe place to access technology, because the library offers:
- trained and supportive staff;
- opportunities to link clients into library and community programs;
- opening hours at a 'safe' time to be out in the community;
- a central, easily accessible location;
- access to free online programs through the library's e-resources;
- free wi-fi.

"When we think about all of our clients when we're doing planning with them, and whenever there's a focus or a goal about technology, more often than not, the library is involved in achieving that goal. It's probably not so much intentional, but that is actually a big message that we probably portray…that the library is a safe place to access technology." (Adult library user, regional library service).

AREA 2: IMPLEMENTATION

Support for the eSmart Libraries initiative was strong across the participating sites. The eSmart Libraries framework had been or had begun to be embedded into library services' policies and procedures; including updating library policies and procedures in areas such as terms and conditions of internet use, online incident response and reporting, staff performance reviews, position descriptions, induction processes, and training.

Library-based eSmart Coordinators reported that they chose to implement eSmart Libraries because of their commitment to "providing safer spaces for community" and maintaining their library's "position as a safe space". Other reasons included the acknowledgement that "cybersafety is becoming more important every day" in libraries, and the desire to demonstrate that libraries "keep pace with technologies".

Staff time and confidence

The majority of library managers (83%) reported that staff had been willing participants in the rollout of the eSmart Libraries initiative. Only a limited number of surveyed staff (12%) reported not participating in the implementation of eSmart Libraries. Just under two thirds of staff (65%) reported that they were inhibited in participating in the implementation of eSmart Libraries. The main inhibitors reported by staff, management and eSmart Coordinators were:
- time;
- confidence;
- knowledge;
- experience.

The implementation of eSmart Libraries and its focus on cybersafety and digital literacy competes with a number of priorities within public libraries. Library services were offering a range of information, support and services to the community in addition to the traditional borrowing of material resources. Services included a wide range of events and activities focused around themes such as heritage, children's literature, seniors, and celebrating multiculturalism. They also provided support programs in areas such as conversational English, job searching and outreach services. Identifying opportunities to develop library staff knowledge, confidence and experience with technology in a timely and efficient way would enhance staff members' ability to participate in eSmart Libraries and share relevant information and skills with library users.

eSmart Coordinators

Participating eSmart Coordinators demonstrated high skill levels in project management, communication and collaboration in implementing the framework. Eighty per cent of surveyed library managers were very confident in their eSmart Coordinator. Essential eSmart Coordinator qualities identified by library managers and staff included:
- project management training or experience;
- passionate interest in technology;
- sound IT knowledge/skills;
- strong leadership and communication skills.

Implementation of the framework was successful when the eSmart Coordinator was a staff member who had interest, expertise and passion for technology; and had experience or understanding of how to work with the library service's management

team. This assisted in navigating the authorising environment within local government. All eSmart Coordinators had set up staff working groups to roll out the framework. This included identifying key staff members to participate in the working group, based on skill sets. In addition, eSmart Coordinators had been effective in delegating implementation tasks to working group members.

Across the participating sites, interviewed eSmart Coordinators' substantive roles fell into three main categories:
- library manager/branch manager;
- IT support/ IT library officer;
- digital literacy and learning librarians.

Identifying the right staff member for the role, based on their substantive position and the size of the organisation, assisted in ensuring successful implementation. Key attributes of an eSmart Coordinator included being a passionate ICT advocate; possessing excellent project management skills; and possessing demonstrated leadership and communication skills.

CASE STUDY #6 – eSMART LIBRARIES COORDINATORS

Library Service D is a large, busy, dynamic metropolitan library service with over 1000 library users coming through the service each day. The service has two main branches and delivers a large range of programs to a culturally diverse community. To implement the eSmart Libraries framework, the service allocated two staff members to the eSmart Coordinator's role; each bringing complementary skills through their work in digital inclusion, user education and library service staff management. They found these complementary skills helped them to implement the program despite limited time allocated to it.

> *"We dovetail... We have different skills, we just work really well together."*
> *(eSmart Coordinator, metropolitan library service)*

To build momentum and kickstart their eSmart journey, the Coordinators undertook a gap analysis and from there identified staff that could participate in the eSmart working group, which would assist them in the implementation based on the gaps. The eSmart working group often worked in pairs; after each meeting, group members would go away with tasks to complete. Strategically, the eSmart Coordinators worked with the library service manager to complete some of the more challenging tasks in relation to policy and procedure change. Through one Coordinator's role on the staff consultative committee, they were able work with their local government's Organisation Development Team to influence the staff code of conduct.

> *"We have got eSmart embedded everywhere."*
> *(eSmart Coordinator, metropolitan library service)*

Implementation of the framework

eSmart Coordinators reported effective or very effective communication with the AMF. This included receiving timely and encouraging feedback that helped them continue to progress the implementation.

> *"[The AMF eSmart Libraries team is] really efficient and very, very helpful in assisting, and they gave you the time of day and they assisted you though it."*
> *(eSmart Coordinator, metropolitan New South Wales)*

Just under half of all surveyed staff had accessed the online portal. The eSmart online portal provides access to resources, the online system tool for reporting and progressing through the framework and access to training and support. Of this group, 70% found the resources provided to be relevant and useful. "eSmart Coordinators discussed both their utilisation of resources from the online portal and, providing relevant resources to the AMF for the portal.

Some library managers and staff reported that the complexity of the framework appeared initially to be an obstacle to effective implementation; as it meant staff were overwhelmed at first or implementation took a significant amount of time. eSmart Coordinators reported that they used the eSmart portal's online system tool and in some instances their own system tool to monitor the implementation; reflecting their need to apply a system that would work best for their own library service.

Staff were implementing the framework on top of busy workloads with competing priorities. Even when library services were committed to implementation, senior management support was deemed essential in order to ensure that staff are allocated sufficient time for eSmart. Advocacy for allocation of sufficient time was often left to individual staff members, who, it was reported, may not feel empowered to ask for allocated time. Library managers and staff also expressed the need for external support in order to not feel burdened by the implementation; to enable them to see it as a core component of their work, which would enhance their service.

Since the data collection phase, and based on feedback from library services and industry representatives, the AMF has streamlined the framework and improved the functionality of the online system tool to better support those implementing eSmart Libraries. The AMF has reported increasing their contact and visits with library services, to further support their implementation of eSmart.

Library industry representatives reported working to counter the perception that the framework is too onerous, by tabling eSmart Libraries as an agenda item at meetings and promoting the changes through their networks. The AMF may like to consider providing additional support to library services to implement the framework, such as developing mentoring opportunities between library services and providing opportunities for library services to share their knowledge and experience of the implementation process.

Resourcing eSmart Libraries

Libraries do not expect to be resourced to deliver eSmart Libraries. However, they did report that programs that offer funds and content, such as training programs, alleviate the pressure on the library service to allocate time and resources. Examples cited included Australian Electoral Commission funding for libraries to deliver training on changes to the voting system in 2016; and Telstra's Tech Savvy Seniors program. In order to enhance the impact of eSmart Libraries, the AMF may consider partnering with other agencies (government and non-government) to deliver digital literacy and/or cybersafety initiatives or programs to diverse library users.

AREA 3: PARTNER & INDUSTRY OBJECTIVES

Facilitating digital inclusion

Library services reported an increased demand to provide online and other tech-based support to community members who may have limited digital literacy skills. The federal government's digital transformation agenda is seeing many government services transitioning online; in particular MyGov, which provides an online portal to access family payments, pensions, unemployment payments, Medicare and taxation, to name a few. Library services are one of only a few community spaces where community members with limited access to technology can gain access to both technology and support. Libraries are faced with the challenge of articulating both their role in the digital transformation agenda and what they are prepared to offer their communities with limited additional resourcing or support. Findings highlighted that the eSmart Libraries framework was enhancing library services' work by guiding library services through a systematic approach to online user access policies and procedures, staff and library user training, and outreach in the community.

Libraries are utilising the eSmart Libraries framework to ensure that both the physical library space and the digital library space are seen as safe places for library users. Library services reported a variety of approaches to support their communities to access technology in a safe, smart and responsible manner. In addition to ensuring they have appropriate policy and procedures in place to respond to library users' use of technology, libraries have invested in upskilling staff, and offering library users training, one-on-one support, 'tech-time' sessions, posters, flyers and information brochures. In some instances these resources are made available in languages other than English.

The main training topics covered by offerings to library users included:
- identity protection;
- privacy;
- blocking and reporting inappropriate posts;
- social media;
- virus protection;
- legal issues relating to online behaviours;
- smart searching.

eSmart Libraries has demonstrated that it can provide a foundation for the library industry to navigate the impact of the digital transformation agenda, and technology more broadly. Libraries are seeking leadership and guidance in navigating the impact of technology on their industry. The AMF might consider partnering with the library industry on research that looks at the impact of the digital transformation agenda on library services; advocating for future resources; and seeking strategic partnerships and opportunities.

CASE STUDY #7 – ACCESS TO TECHNOLOGY (2). LIBRARY USER, METROPOLITAN LIBRARY SERVICE

Peter moved to Australia with his wife and children a year and a half ago. When they arrived they had to quickly find a house to move into. The house they rented was a new property in a newly developed area of the city, and didn't have internet or a phone line installed. It took four and a half months to get a phone line, due to issues between the phone company and the landlord.

Peter and his family found the local library and started visiting regularly to access books, DVDs and the internet. The library had a huge impact on them. All Peter's job searches and job applications were done online. Being able to get online in the library meant that Peter could find employment.

> *"It made an enormous difference to our lives… It meant that we could lead a normal life whilst we waited for things to be installed at home, and starting work…" (Peter, metropolitan library service)*

Peter's local library is an eSmart Library. He has noticed some 'cybersmart' initiatives around the library, such as the deep freeze on the public PCs that deletes any previous users data off the public PC once they have logged out, and a recent cybersafety promotional campaign displayed on banners in the library. Peter's experience of asking for assistance with technology in the library has been positive.

> *"…each and every employee here [is] always there, you ask them something, they help immediately."… (Peter, metropolitan library service).*

The library service has been looking at ways to improve its support to library users. It has recently transitioned to RFID, Radio Frequency Identification Data, technology which has supported the staff to get out and about amongst library users and assist them. The service has also produced fact sheets for library users with tips on using technology in the library; and is working with a local university to deliver tech training programs to the community.

Reaching young people

Three quarters of survey participants aged 25 years and younger used the free wi-fi in their public library, with 45% accessing the internet weekly and 16% daily. Young people reported visiting the library to study, borrow books, volunteer, or attend organised activities and courses. The majority of young people surveyed (80%) felt confident to stay safe online. Three quarters reported learning about cybersafety at school. A small number (6%) had undertaken cybersafety training in their library. One quarter (25%) had heard of eSmart Libraries and had seen advertising for cybersafety training in the library; and 22% had seen eSmart Libraries posters and media.

Young people reported that they thought the library was a safe place to access technology. Correspondingly, more than three quarters (79%) of surveyed parents thought the library was a safe place for their children to access online spaces.

Close to three quarters (74%) of surveyed young people reported that they would ask a library staff member for assistance if they came across something unsafe online.

Many libraries reported that, with the introduction of wi-fi and the reconfiguration of library spaces to include more open-plan study areas, more young people were coming in to study, play games and socialise. Although public libraries were not reported as the place young people learnt about cybersafety – the majority report schools as their main source of information – libraries were offering consistent messaging about online safety; embedding appropriate policy and procedures to ensure safety and help build a community of understanding and good practice around online safety. The AMF may wish to explore opportunities to highlight the interrelationship between eSmart Schools and eSmart Libraries in providing young people with safe spaces within their community.

CASE STUDY # 8 - ACCESS TO TECHNOLOGY (3). YOUNG PERSON, METROPOLITAN LIBRARY SERVICE

Sarah is a 19-year-old who has been visiting her local metropolitan library service with her sister since she was in prep. Sarah uses the library service to borrow books and to study. Until a couple of months ago she didn't have the internet at home, and until she started university a year ago she never had a computer; so all her primary and secondary school study was undertaken at the library, where she could access the computer and internet access free of charge. For example, she would use the computers to work on her chemistry practical and geography reports, and she would print off any slides or reports required by teachers.

The library service also promoted local services and, through her engagement with the library, Sarah learnt about and engaged with the youth services programs in her area: *"I would not have done half the things if it wasn't for that." (Sarah, metropolitan library service)*

The library service that Sarah visits has almost 50 public-access computers and delivers a range of digital-literacy programs. The service became eSmart in 2016. It promotes its eSmart Libraries status through the website and within the physical library. It has recently started to run a Tech Savvy Seniors program in different community languages.

Sarah is one of many students that use the library space for study. The library is considered a safe place in the community for families to go. Sarah considers the library a safe place to access the internet: *"[A]t home you can hide in the corner and nobody can see what you are doing. But in a public library, people are walking by, there are librarians. It is a really open space."* She believes the library is a safe place for children: *"I'd pretty much guarantee safety for kids, it's a good environment and the librarians are pretty vigilant about what's happening." (Sarah, metropolitan library service)*

Sarah values the library, as it has played an important role in her access to technology for education, as well as reading for enjoyment.

"I do not want the library to go away. I need it here forever." (Sarah, metropolitan library service)

Working with industry partners

The library industry has taken a particular interest in the rollout of eSmart Libraries nationally. Peak bodies have continued to participate in the eSmart Libraries Reference Group. The Australian Library and Information Association (ALIA) has identified eSmart Libraries as an initiative that is assisting libraries to ensure library users access technology in a safe way. eSmart is discussed in the 'ALIA Australian Public Library Alliance National Strategy and Action Plan 2015–2018' at 'Strategic Priority 2: Providing safe and equitable access to information, resources and egovernment' (ALIA/APLA, 2015, p. 5).

Although not specifically referencing eSmart, the library industry, in its recent update of 'Guidelines, Standards and Outcome Measures for Australian Public Libraries' has included technology access as a guideline and digital inclusion as an outcome measure (ALIA, 2016, pp. 42-44 & pp. 80-81). This speaks to the importance of technology use in public libraries and represents an enhancement of the previous standards and guidelines regarding technology, which focused primarily on the need for IT hardware. The AMF was invited to participate in a workshop on the development of these guidelines, standards and outcome measures. In addition, the ALIA 2016 federal government policy platform, 'The Library and Information Agenda' (ALIA, 2016), advocated for funding to resource libraries to support library users accessing egovernment services.

In 2014, the Public Libraries Victoria Network (PLVN) held a workshop with library staff from a number of the Victorian eSmart Libraries pilot sites. This workshop encouraged information sharing and collaboration between the pilot libraries and helped services to work though any operational obstacles they were facing in the implementation. In late 2015 the PLVN released its 'eGov Ready Tool Kit' for libraries (2015a), and a companion report. The tool kit and report titled 'Putting the "Go!" in eGov' (2015b) states that it aims to assist library services to prepare for the e-government rollout in 2017. eSmart Libraries is not referenced in the report, although it could be argued that the framework is also preparing library services to support the egovernment rollout though the implementation of its five domains.

The AMF has had success in South Australia with the introduction of eSmart Libraries into school and community libraries across the state. The South Australian Public Library Network (SAPLN) and local governments have supported this. In addition, AMF has been in discussion with Public Libraries Western Australia (PLWA) about how the eSmart Libraries framework can inform Western Australia's digital transformation agenda.

Through its eSmart Libraries Reference Group and participation in sector activities, the AMF has developed strong strategic relationships across national and state library industry peak bodies. In order to stay relevant to the library industry, the AMF should continue its open dialogue with eSmart Libraries Reference Group members and other industry representatives, regarding key priorities, areas of interest and research that could lead to strategic advocacy or programming opportunities for the AMF.

Brand and messaging

Surveyed library managers, staff and users gave positive feedback on their understanding of the eSmart Libraries brand and related partnerships. Site visits confirmed that all libraries in the sustaining phase were branding brochures, posters and banners with the eSmart Libraries, AMF and Telstra Foundation logos.

The eSmart Libraries framework has its greatest impact on library management and staff, as they are the implementers of the initiative. When asked if they knew of the Alannah & Madeline Foundation, 100% of managers, 69% of staff and 45% of library users were aware of the Foundation.

Just under half (47%) of surveyed library users had seen posters/media about eSmart in their library. When asked directly whether they knew of eSmart Libraries, approximately one third (32%) of library users had heard of eSmart Libraries; and library users across all library services had heard of the initiative. Of these, 48% were aware of the Telstra Foundation partnership. 100% of surveyed library managers and 60% of staff were aware that the Telstra Foundation was a partner in the delivery of eSmart Libraries. Overall, 18% of surveyed library users were aware of the Telstra Foundation partnership.

Libraries' investment in the eSmart Libraries framework has been targeted at ensuring that the public library environment supports library users to increase their cybersafety knowledge and digital literacy skills. Opportunities exist to continue to build on this work to enhance the brand and the key messages of eSmart Libraries to increase impact on library users; in particular, through developing targeted messages and resources for digitally disadvantaged user groups. Evidence from successful mass-media health-promotion campaigns suggests that influencing the information environment and maximising exposure and creative social media marketing and messages can enhance the impact of key health-promotion messages (Randolph & Viswanath, 2004). The AMF could work to maximise its brand exposure by identifying opportunities with its funding and industry partners; to enforce consistent messages across multiple environments, building on existing programs and products (e.g., eSmart Schools and the eSmart Digital Licence).

Cyberbullying

All library managers (100%) and a majority of library staff (59%) reported that eSmart Libraries had made a difference to cybersafety and the management of cyberbullying. In discussions, library managers were able to articulate how they would respond to a cyberbullying incident in the library. Library staff reported mixed understanding and experience of how to respond to cyberbullying, particularly at library services where staff had not been trained; with the exception of one library service, which had the opportunity to implement specific training in responding to cyberbullying incidents through the Office of the Children's eSafety Commissioner's eSafe spaces program. The majority of Library users were aware of or had experienced the impact of cyberbullying through friends, media or family members.

The eSafe spaces program is a good example of a program complementary to eSmart Libraries; as it offers training to library staff on how to respond to and report cyberbullying, building staff confidence and capacity that ultimately aids the library user. The AMF could work with the Office of the Children's eSafety Commissioner to explore the rollout of eSafe spaces into Libraries that are eSmart, as a key strategic partnership with government that could build library staff's knowledge and confidence regarding cyberbullying. It is advised that the AMF advocate for eSafe spaces to be rolled out to small- to medium-sized library services, where the relationships between library users and staff are strong.

AREA 4: PERCEPTIONS

Industry perceptions

> *"I think it's a great program....it's an opportunity for libraries to be part of the conversation about the digital world… and also showcasing…that libraries are just as much about digital literacy now as they are about print literacy."*
> *(Library industry representative)*

In interviews, library industry representatives articulated the value of the eSmart Libraries initiative in embedding cybersafety and digital literacy support into public libraries. They also discussed some of their concerns about the implementation of the framework, which did not reflect on the quality of the framework, but, rather, the pressures on library services, including the following:

- the range of competing programming priorities;
- tighter budgets, which can impact on resourcing the implementation of the initiative. (In particular, resourcing staff is a big challenge for small library services. No direct financial resources are available through eSmart Libraries to relieve this pressure);
- time pressures (including staffing issues);
- libraries may already be confident in their cybersafety and digital literacy services and programs, and see no need to be involved in the initiative.

Library industry representatives, particularly those who are members of the eSmart Libraries Reference Group, have played an important role in advocating for the eSmart Libraries initiative, especially with respect to changes to the online system tool. They were keen to see the eSmart Libraries framework embedded into digital service delivery within public libraries, ensuring that staff are confident and trained to support library users. They saw the eSmart Libraries framework as assisting library services to maintain their position as trusted access points for the public to utilise digital technology; and ensuring a safe space for library users.

The AMF face challenges in working with library services that are grappling with competing priorities. In order to continue to demonstrate the relevance of the eSmart Libraries framework to the library industry, the AMF may consider presenting at industry conferences and forums and/or attending industry-network meetings.

Local government perceptions

> *"We made a decision to commit to it because we feel it is important for us to be a quality service and to support our community."*
> *(Local government representative, metropolitan Victoria)*

Local government staff who oversee library services (directors or group managers) have the capacity to play an important role in the implementation of the eSmart Libraries initiative, as they are often the conduit between the library service and the local government executive and elected Councillors. In interviews, local government representatives highlighted that the eSmart Libraries initiative had:

- provided a platform to profile the work of the library to senior Council management and elected Councillors;
- assisted library services in demonstrating their risk mitigation strategies in relation to online use in the library;
- enhanced libraries' credibility with community;
- improved staff confidence and capacity.

Local government representatives were keen to ensure that the eSmart Libraries initiative is embedded in library services as a best-practice framework. They saw this as the responsibility of the library service and the AMF, working in partnership.

> *"I want to see the eSmart brand continue to grow recognition."*
> *(Local government representative, metropolitan Victoria)*

The AMF may consider seeking further opportunities to promote to local government executive and elected representatives how the eSmart Libraries framework can enhance and/or complement their risk management policies and procedures in public libraries.

Library services' perceptions

Overwhelmingly, implementing eSmart Libraries has provided a useful, comprehensive and complementary initiative for library services. All library managers (100%) and a large majority of staff (80%) surveyed said they would recommend the eSmart Libraries initiative to another library service. Library management reflected on how the eSmart Libraries framework had enhanced their digital literacy and cybersafety program delivery. As discussed earlier in this report, library management and staff were able to identify benefits of the implementation of eSmart Libraries, such as:

- increased staff knowledge, including improved conversations about cybersafety between staff, and improved understanding of cybersafety principles;
- improved policies and procedures;
- improved library-user knowledge on how to be safe, smart and responsible online, as a result of raising awareness and delivering training in line with the eSmart Libraries framework.

Library management also highlighted that implementing the eSmart framework gave library services an opportunity to demonstrate their skills and expertise in the cybersafety and digital literacy space to their elected representatives.

> *"We weren't on the strategic radar with [local government] before, so that was one of the benefits of having eSmart."*
> *(Library manager, metropolitan Victoria)*

> *"We took some of the training and the concepts…to Council and helped educate Council and Council staff, which was really good because it was…the library [demonstrating] our skillset in this area."*
> *(Library manager, regional Queensland)*

Like local government representatives, library managers discussed the need to ensure that once the library reached the sustaining phase, momentum around eSmart did not dissipate. They reflected that not only do library services need to continue to be proactive about updating resources and staff and user training in cybersafety and digital literacy; they also need support and prompts from the AMF.

One library manager indicated that there may be potential to utilise social media more proactively across library services to highlight how eSmart Libraries is being implemented, by hash-tagging examples of eSmart practices in the library service on Twitter, Facebook and Instagram. This could be a simple and effective way for library services to learn from each other.

Other opportunities to ensure libraries stay connected to the AMF and the initiative, once they are in the sustaining phase, may include:

- identifying opportunities, in partnership with sustaining-phase library-service representatives, to co-present on the benefits of implementing the framework;
- exploring mentoring opportunities between sustaining-phase library services and library services in the planning stage – this could be undertaken at a regional or state level.

CONCLUSION

The Wave Two findings highlight how the eSmart Libraries framework is enhancing libraries' delivery of safe, smart and responsible technology services; in particular, assisting library services to identify what support library staff require in order to build staff confidence, capacity and skill in order to support library users to use online technology in smart, safe and responsible ways. The implementation of eSmart Libraries has corresponded with the library industry's defining its role in relation to supporting library users to navigate both the national digital transformation agenda and the development of new technologies.

eSmart Libraries provides library services – once they are in the sustaining phase – with a brand enabling them to market that they are a safe place to access technology – both to their library users and to government bodies. Libraries have been able to utilise this brand, along with the actions they have taken throughout the planning and implementation phases, to promote to local government and their communities the importance they place on ensuring library users are able to improve their digital literacy skills and cybersafety awareness.

Opportunities exist for the AMF to capitalise on the support of industry representatives to enhance the rollout of eSmart Libraries and build the eSmart brand; and to explore how the framework could support complementary programs such as Tech Savvy Seniors, eSafe spaces or be promoted through online initiatives such as Go Digi.

Key challenges for the eSmart Libraries initiative include mitigating the perceived and real challenges of the complexity of implementing the eSmart Libraries framework, for libraries on limited resources and with competing priorities; and ensuring that once libraries reach the sustaining phase, they continue to be engaged in the initiative so that eSmart remains relevant and of value to their library service.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Opportunities for the Alannah & Madeline Foundation

The eSmart suite of programs is now seven years old. The social and behavioural change framework that underpins the eSmart initiatives has been independently evaluated on two occasions, and both evaluations indicate that the eSmart offering is robust and impactful. The following recommendations build on this solid platform, aiming to strengthen the eSmart offerings further and position the initiative to maximise impact locally, nationally and internationally.

GAME CHANGERS

Refine the library service experience of the framework

The AMF's recent change to provide libraries with enhanced support to successfully implement the framework responds to key evaluation findings. Recent changes include:
- streamlining the framework and online system tool;
- offering opportunities for one-on-one support to library eSmart Coordinators and more library visits.

These actions will build confidence in the framework, demonstrating that the AMF has been responsive to industry feedback.

Increase staff knowledge and confidence to better impact library users

- Consider expanding the eSmart Community Engagement Program to libraries; in particular, offering workshops for staff in supporting library users to be safe online.

- Work with the Office of the Children's eSafety Commissioner to explore the rollout of eSafe spaces into libraries that are eSmart, as a key strategic partnership with government in building library staff's knowledge and confidence in addressing cyberbullying. Consider targeting small- to medium-sized library services.

Build the profile of eSmart Libraries nationally

Demonstrate to the library industry how eSmart Libraries can provide a framework for navigating the impact of the digital transformation agenda, and technology more broadly, on the work of library services; in order to meet increasing public expectations. This may include:
- partnering on a research or advocacy piece with the library industry on the impact of e-government, upskilling staff, or creating digitally safe spaces;
- offering peak bodies evaluation evidence on the impact the digital transformation agenda is having in libraries.
- continuing an open discussion with eSmart Libraries Reference Group members about key priorities, areas of interest and research that could lead to strategic advocacy or programming opportunities for the AMF.

Get eSmart Libraries on the public agenda

The AMF may wish to explore opportunities to maximise exposure with its funding and industry partners, such as:
- developing targeted messages and resources for digitally disadvantaged user groups;
- identifying ways to enforce consistent messages across multiple environments, building on its existing programs and products (e.g., eSmart Schools and the eSmart Digital Licence).

Profile the framework and build key strategic relationships internationally

The AMF has demonstrated expertise and leadership in the cybersafety and digital literacy space, and this report shows the impact of the eSmart Libraries initiative. The Foundation may wish to explore how it can participate in setting the agenda in an international arena, where there is an appetite for successful, evidence-based digital literacy and cybersafety programs.

This may include attending and presenting at the Family Online Safety Institute (FOSI) Annual Conference. FOSI is an international not-for-profit organisation with a board membership comprising representatives of many of the largest technology companies. It is seen as a key global organisation leading policy and research discussions in online safety. The AMF could consider liaising with FOSI to present findings of the eSmart Libraries evaluation at future conferences, to raise the profile of the eSmart initiatives.

PROGRAMMATIC RECOMMENDATIONS

Integrate eSmart Schools and eSmart Libraries
Continue to look for opportunities to integrate eSmart Schools and eSmart Libraries. In the first instance, this may be achieved by promoting, to eSmart Libraries, which schools on their 'patch' are eSmart. This could later be expanded through the online portal, to support collaboration and information sharing.

Offer further support to library services
Provide additional support to library services in the implementation of the framework. This could include:
- developing mentoring opportunities between library services;
- providing opportunities for library services to share knowledge and experience of implementing the framework.

Partner to help deliver other initiatives to eSmart Libraries
Consider partnering with other agencies (government and non-government) to deliver digital literacy and/or cybersafety initiatives or programs to diverse library users. Opportunities could include:
- working with Telstra to ensure that Tech Savvy Seniors is made available to eSmart Libraries, and deliver eSmart in tandem;
- offering the eSmart Community Engagement Program's digital parenting workshop to libraries.

Keep libraries in the loop through all phases of eSmart Libraries

Ensure that libraries can stay connected to the AMF and the initiative once they are in the sustaining stage. This may include:

- identifying opportunities, in partnership with sustaining-phase library service representatives, to co-present on the benefits of implementing the framework;
- exploring mentoring opportunities between sustaining-phase library services and library services in the planning stage (this could be at a regional or state level);
- encouraging libraries to use social media as a resource tool, in order to share approaches to the implementation of eSmart.

PROMOTION AND POSITIONING OF ESMART LIBRARIES

Demonstrate the importance of eSmart to libraries and local government

Continue to identify opportunities to demonstrate the relevance of eSmart Libraries to the library industry. This may include presenting at industry conferences and forums, and/or attending industry-network meetings.

Continue to seek opportunities to promote to local-government executive and elected representatives how the eSmart Libraries framework can enhance and complement their risk management policy and procedures in public libraries. This may be done through writing to local government Councillors, Chief Executive Officers or risk management staff, providing case studies, reports or newsletter items; or presenting at conferences.

Seek strategic partnerships in government

Consider investing in developing an Australian government relations strategy, in order to identify any key strategic partnerships that could enhance the uptake and delivery of eSmart Libraries nationally.

Develop public presentation opportunities

Seek out opportunities to promote the eSmart Libraries initiative and findings of the eSmart Libraries evaluation at international library conferences and forums.

Contact the International Telecommunications Union (ITU) to discuss opportunities to connect with and present to member states and/or leading technology companies. The ITU is a specialised agency of the United Nations. Key action areas of the ITU include the digital divide and young people. The ITU is currently consulting with children in the area of cyberbullying.

REFERENCES

Alannah & Madeline Foundation (2012). 'AMF Briefing Document', unpublished.

Australian Communications and Media Authority (2016). 'Digital Lives of Older Australians'. Research Snapshot, Accessed 19 January 2017: http://www.acma.gov.au/theACMA/engage-blogs/engage-blogs/Research-snapshots/Digital-lives-of-older-Australians.

Australian Libraries and Information Association (2016). 'Guidelines, Standards and Outcome Measures for Australian Public Libraries', July 2016. Accessed 9 January 2017: https://www.alia.org.au/sites/default/files/Guidelines%20Standards%20and%20Outcome%20Measures%20for%20Australian%20Public%20Libraries.pdf

Australian Libraries and Information Association/Australian Public Library Alliance (2015). 'ALIA Australian Public Library Alliance National Strategy and Action Plan 2015–2018'. Accessed 9 January 2017: https://www.alia.org.au/sites/default/files/National%20Strategy.pdf

Bertot, J. C. (2016). 'Building Digitally Inclusive Communities: The Roles of Public Libraries in Digital Inclusion and Development'. Proceedings of the 9th International Conference on Theory and Practice of Electronic Governance, Montevideo, Uruguay, 2016.

Bertot, J. C., Real, B. & Jaeger, P. T. (2016). 'Public Libraries Building Digital Inclusive Communities: Data and Findings from the 2013 Digital Inclusion Survey'. *The Library Quarterly*, 86(3), 270–289. doi: 10.1086/686674.

Fitzgerald, B., Fletcher, L. & Kop, T. (2016). 'A National Approach to Digital Inclusion and Digital Literacy: What Can This Mean for Public Libraries?'. Paper presented at the 18th VALA Biennial Conference and Exhibition, Melbourne, 2016. Accessed 4 January 2017: http://www.vala.org.au/direct-download/vala2016-proceedings/vala2016-papers/608-vala2016-session-17-fitzgerald-paper/file

Jaeger, P. T., Bertot, J. C., Thompson, K. M., Katz, S. M. & DeCoster, E. J. (2012). 'The Intersection of Public Policy and Public Access: Digital Divides, Digital Literacy, Digital Inclusion, and Public Libraries'. *Public Library Quarterly*, 31(1), 1–20. doi: 10.1080/01616846.2012.654728.

Liberal Party of Australia (2016). 'Improving the Digital Confidence and Skills of Senior Australians'. Media release, 26 June 2016. Accessed 4 January 2016: https://www.liberal.org.au/latest-news/2016/06/26/improving-digital-confidence-and-skills-senior-australians

Public Libraries Victoria Network (2015a). 'eGov Ready Tool Kit', Public Libraries Victoria Network, Melbourne, Victoria

Public Libraries Victoria Network (2015b). 'Putting the "Go!" in eGov'. Accessed [19 Jan 2017]: https://media.wix.com/ugd/1f8737_6a418fd58e524bbab2915b7fb1ec01c2.pdf

Randolph, W. & Viswanath K. (2004). 'Lessons Learned from Public Health Mass Media Campaigns: Marketing Health in a Crowded Media World'. *Annual Review of Public Health*, 25, 419–437. doi: 10.1146/annurev.publhealth.25.101802.123046

Thomas, J., Barraket, J., Ewing, S., MacDonald, T., Mundell, M. & Tucker, J. (2016). *Measuring Australia's Digital Divide: The Australian Digital Inclusion Index 2016*. Melbourne: Swinburne University of Technology, for Telstra.